

Islamic Finance

Law, Economics, and Practice

This book provides an overview of the practice of Islamic finance and the historical roots that define its modes of operation. The focus of the book is analytical and forward-looking. It shows that Islamic finance exists primarily today as a form of rent-seeking legal arbitrage. An alternative that emphasizes substance rather than form would serve religious and moral objectives better, through mutual and similar financial practices.

Mahmoud A. El-Gamal is Professor of Economics and Statistics at Rice University, where he holds the endowed Chair in Islamic Economics, Finance, and Management. Prior to joining Rice in 1998, he had been an associate professor of Economics at the University of Wisconsin at Madison and an assistant professor of Economics at California Institute of Technology and the University of Rochester. He has also served in the Middle East Department of the International Monetary Fund (1995–6) and as the first Scholar in Residence on Islamic Finance at the U.S. Department of the Treasury in 2004. He has published extensively in the areas of econometrics, finance, experimental economics, and Islamic law and finance.



Islamic Finance Law, Economics, and Practice

Mahmoud A. El-Gamal *Rice University*





Cambridge University Press

0521864143 - Islamic Finanace: Law, Economics, and Practice

Mahmoud A. El-Gamal

Frontmatter More information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521864145

© Mahmoud A. El-Gamal 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

El-Gamal, Mahmoud A., 1963-

Islamic finance: law, economics, and practice / Mahmoud A. El-Gamal.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0-521-86414-3 (hardback)

Banking law (Islamic law).
 2. Business enterprises – Finance – Law and legislation –
 Islamic countries.
 3. Securities.
 4. Finance – Religious aspects – Islam.
 5. Economics –
 Religious aspects – Islam.
 I. Title.

KBP940.E45 2006

332.0917'67-dc22 2006005127

ISBN-13 978-0-521-86414-5 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-86414-3 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To
Father

& Mother,
who taught me
that religious forms
should continually serve
their central moral substance



Contents

List of Illustrations			page x
Preface			xi
Glossary and Transliteration			XV
I	Intro	1	
		Finance without Interest?	2
	1.1	Distinguishing Features of Islamic Finance	7
		Prohibition-Driven Finance	8
		Jurists, Shari'a Boards, and Innovation	11
		Lawyers and Regulatory Arbitrage	13
	1.2	Islamic Transactions Law as Common Law	15
		Precedents, Analogies, and Nominate Contracts	17
		Tradeoff between Efficiency and Legitimacy	20
	1.3	Limits and Dangers of Shari'a Arbitrage	21
		Risk of Mispricing	22
		Legal and Regulatory Risks	23
2	Juris	prudence and Arbitrage	26
	2.1	Islamic Law and Jurisprudence	27
		The Canon: Qur'an, Tradition, and Consensus	27
		Juristic Inference (<i>Ijtihad</i>) and Benefit Analysis	28
	2.2	From Classical to Contemporary Jurisprudence	30
		Jurisprudence, Revival, and Codification	31
		Institution of <i>Fatwa</i> and Islamic Finance	32
	2.3	Arbitraging Classical Jurisprudence	35
		Shari'a-Arbitraging Classical Property Law	36
		Arbitraging Classical Contract Conditions	42
		Arbitrage, Ruses, and Islamic Finance	44

vii



V111		Contents		
3	Two Major Prohibitions: Riba and Gharar			
	3.1	The Prohibition of <i>Riba</i>	49	
		Canonical Texts on Riba	49	
		Economic Substance of the Prohibition of Riba	52	
	3.2	The Prohibition of Gharar	58	
		Definition of Gharar	59	
		Economic Substance of Prohibition	60	
		Insurance and Derivatives	61	
	3.3	Bundled vs. Unbundled Credit and Risk	62	
4	Sale-	Based Islamic Finance	64	
	4.1	Basic Rules for Sales	65	
		Trust Sales: Murabaha, Tawliya, Wadi'a	67	
		Currency Exchange (Sarf)	68	
	4.2	Same-Item Sale-Repurchase ('Ina)	70	
		Same-Item Trading in 'Ina and Tawarruq	70	
		Custody Sale (Bay' Al-'uhda) and Sukuk Al-ijara	73	
	4.3	Cost of Funds: Interest-Rate Benchmarks	74	
		Opportunity Cost for Conventional Fund Providers	75	
		Viability of Islamic Benchmark Alternatives	77	
5	Derivative-Like Sales: Salam, Istisna', and 'Urbun		81	
	5.1	Prepaid Forward Sale (Salam)	81	
		Parallel <i>Salam</i>	83	
		Conventional and Synthesized Forwards	86	
	5.2	Commission to Manufacture (Istisna')	90	
	5.3	Down-Payment Sale ('Urbun)	91	
		'Urbun as Call Option	92	
6	Leas	ing, Securitization, and Sukuk	97	
	6.1	General Lease Conditions	97	
		Flexible-Rate Financing	100	
		Subleasing, Repairs, and Insurance Costs	100	
	6.2	Asset-Backed Securities	102	
		Leasing and Securitization	102	
		Receivable Securitization and Sale of Debt	104	
		Bundling Asset-Based and Debt-Based Securities: A Paradox	106	
	6.3	Asset-Backed Leasing Bonds (Sukuk)	107	
		Credit-Rating Issues	108	
		Reward Pledges and Gifts Revisited	110	
	6.4	Usufruct Sukuk	113	
	6.5	Sukuk Al-Salam	114	



		Contents	ix
7	Partn	erships and Equity Investment	117
	7.1	Classical Types of Partnership	117
		Silent Partnership: Theoretical Workhorse of Islamic Finance	120
		Valid and Defective Silent Partnerships	122
	7.2	Common-Stock Ownership	123
		"Islamic Screens" and Their Shortcomings	125
		Cleansing Returns	133
		Positive Screens and the Islamic Brand Name	134
8	Islam	ic Financial Institutions	135
	8.1	Banking and Islamic Banking	137
		Theoretical Structure: Two-Tier Silent Partnership	138
		Deposits vs. Loans: Trust and Guaranty	144
	8.2	Insurance and Takaful	147
	8.3	Two Sides of the Two Debates	151
		Shari'a Arbitrage vs. Islamic Prudential Regulation	152
	8.4	Generic Agency Characterization of Financial Institutions	153
9	Governance and Regulatory Solutions in Mutuality		162
	9.1	Rent-Seeking Shari'a Arbitrage and Absence of Mutuality	163
		Potential for Mutuality in Islamic Banking	166
		Need for Mutuality in Takaful	170
	9.2	A Call for Mutuality in Banking and Insurance	171
		Mutuality in Banking	172
		Mutuality in Insurance	173
10	Beyon	nd Shari'a Arbitrage	175
	10.1	Shari'a Arbitrage and Criminal Finance	176
	10.2	Shari'a Arbitrage at the Limit	177
		Benchmarking ad Absurdum	178
		Hedge-Fund Instruments – Shariʻa-Arbitrage Style	180
	10.3	Self-Destructiveness of Shari'a Arbitrage	181
		Declining Shari'a-Arbitrage Profit Margins	182
		Dilution of the "Islamic" Brand Name	183
	10.4	Toward a New Islamic Finance Identity	184
		Macroeconomic Substance: Privatization Sukuk	185
		Mosque-Based Network of Financial Mutuals	186
		Positive Screens, Ethical Investment	188
Conc	lusion		190
Notes			193
Biblio	ography		213
Index			219



List of Illustrations

1.1	Home Mortgage Transaction	3
1.2	Juristic Characterization of Mortgage Loan	4
1.3	Murabaha Alternative for Home Finance	5
1.4	Tabreed Sukuk Structure	7
1.5	Prisoners' Dilemma	10
5.1	Forward Synthesized from Salam and Credit Sales	87
5.2	Al-Ahli Secured Fund Returns	94
5.3	Al-Rajhi Aman 1 Fund Returns	95
6.1	Structure of Qatar Global Sukuk	108
6.2	Structure of BMA Sukuk Al-Salam	115



Preface

In recent years, financial activities conducted under the banner of "Islamic finance" have grown significantly in volume and scope, attracting significant attention worldwide. Numerous books and articles have been published on the topic over the past few decades. Their genres have ranged from highly religious treatises on Islamic law and worldview to highly practical surveys of the latest Islamic financial products to reach the market. Why, one must ask, should one read – let alone write – another book on the subject?

This book provides a qualitative overview of the practice of Islamic finance and the historical roots that have defined its modes of operation. The purpose of the book is not to survey the latest developments in this fast-growing industry. In the current information age, such information is best obtained on the Internet, since it requires updating at rates far exceeding the publication cycles of books and journal articles.

The focus of this book is analytical and forward-looking. I show that, despite the good intentions of its pioneers, Islamic finance has placed excessive emphasis on contract forms, thus becoming a primary target for rent-seeking legal arbitrageurs. In every aspect of finance – from personal loans to investment banking, and from market structure to corporate governance of financial institutions – Islamic finance aims to replicate in Islamic forms the substantive functions of contemporary financial instruments, markets, and institutions.

This supposed Islamization of contemporary financial practice is accomplished by means of modified premodern financial contracts (such as sales, leases, and simple partnerships). The contracts are designed by teams of (1) financial professionals who make and cater to the market for "Islamic" products, (2) lawyers who are skilled in the art of regulatory arbitrage, and (3) jurists or religious scholars who are familiar with medieval juristic texts (mostly in Arabic) and provide certification of the Islamicity of various financial products and services.



xii Preface

To make the classical juristic literature (on which the industry is built) accessible to English-reading audiences, I have provided a translation of one of the most comprehensive surveys of classical Islamic jurisprudence and its contemporary understanding; see Al-Zuhayli (2003). The book in your hands contains the argument that the classical jurisprudence in that survey aimed mainly to enhance fairness and economic efficiency, subject to the legal and regulatory constraints of premodern societies. In this regard, many of the intended economic and prudential regulatory functions of classical contract conditions are currently served by other means that were made possible through advances in communication, legal structures, and information technology.

By attempting to replicate the substance of contemporary financial practice using premodern contract forms, Islamic finance has arguably failed to serve the objectives of Islamic Law (magasid al-Shari'a): Wherever the substance of contemporary financial practice is in accordance with Islamic Law, adherence to premodern contract forms (with or without modification) leads most often to avoidable efficiency losses, thus violating one of the main legal objectives that defined classical Islamic jurisprudence. Conversely, by focusing on Islamicity of contract forms rather than substance (in part to justify efficiency losses), Islamic finance has often failed to serve the economic purpose for which certain premodern contract structures were codified in classical jurisprudence. This book provides multiple examples of both types of departure from serving Islamic legal objectives. The case is also made that form-oriented Islamic finance is not sustainable in the long term, because of (1) inherent dangers of using sophisticated structured finance methods in Islamic countries with relatively unsophisticated regulators and (2) competitive pressures that dictate convergence to efficient conventional financial modes.

I propose refocusing Islamic finance on substance rather than form. This would entail abandoning the paradigm of "Islamization" of every financial practice. It would also entail reorienting the brand name of Islamic finance to emphasize issues of community banking, microfinance, socially responsible investment, and the like. In other words, I argue that the "Islamic" in "Islamic finance" should relate to the social and economic ends of financial transactions, rather than the contract mechanics through which financial ends are achieved. I provide specific examples of areas where such reorientation of the brand name may in fact provide value to individual customers of the industry, as well as society more generally.

A Note on Terms of Reverence

It is customary in Islamic writings to use terms of reverence when significant religious figures are mentioned. For instance, mention of the Prophet is traditionally



Preface xiii

followed by the phrase "salla Allahu 'alayhi wa sallam" (may God bless him and give him peace), and the mention of his companions is traditionally followed by the phrase "radiya Allahu 'anhu" (may God be pleased with him). However, Western academic writings conventionally eliminate the use of such terms of reverence. Following the latter convention, I shall not use terms of reverence in this book, as non-specialists and non-Muslims may find them distracting. In the meantime, I assure pious readers that I share their respect for all religious figures. I hope that they will not be offended by omission of printed terms of reverence, which readers may nonetheless vocalize at their discretion.

Mahmoud A. El-Gamal Houston, December 2005



Glossary and Transliteration

```
Allāb - God.
amāna - trust, possession of.
'aqd – contract.
bātil - invalid (contract).
bay - sale.
bay al-amāna – variation on same-item sale-repurchase ('īna).
bay al- ina – same-item sale-repurchase.
bay al-kāli bi-l-kāli - trading one deferred obligation for another, forbidden
         based on a tradition with questionable authenticity.
bay al- uhda – variation on same-item sale-repurchase (ina).
bay al-wafa - variation on same-item sale-repurchase ('īna).
bay bi-thaman ājil - credit sale.
companion – immediate follower of the Prophet.
damān - guaranty, possession of.
darar - harm or injury.
dayn – debt or liability for fungible property.
dīnār - Roman gold coins, adopted as currency in early Islam.
dirham – Persian silver coins, adopted as currency in early Islam.
fa'ida - (literally: benefit) interest, plural fawa'id.
fāsid – defective (contract).
fatwā – religious edict or opinion, plural fatāwā, anglicized plural fatwas.
figh – juristic understanding or inference based on Sharī'a.
fudūlī – uncommissioned agent.
gharar - risk or uncertainty, forbidden if excessive and avoidable.
hadīth – report of Prophetic or other early Islamic tradition.
Hanafī – belonging to the juristic school of Abū Ḥanīfa, see note 24, Chapter 2.
Hanbali - belonging to the juristic school of Ahmad ibn Hanbal, see note 24,
         Chapter 2.
```



xvi

Glossary and Transliteration

```
hiba - gift.
hijra – the Prophet's migration from Makka to Yathrib (later called Madina).
hīla – ruse, legal stratagem to circumvent various prohibitions, plural hiyal.
bukm Shar i – Islamic legal status ruling.
īdā - fiduciary deposit contract.
ijāra – lease or hire contract.
ijmā - juristic consensus.
ijtihād – juristic inference.
'illa – juristic reason or grounds for analogy.
iqāla - contract revocation.
istiḥsān – juristic approbation, to overrule juristic analogy.
istislāh – benefit analysis, to overrule juristic analogy.
istisnā - commission to manufacture.
Jamā'at-i-Islāmī - Islamist party founded by Pakistani writer Abu Al-A'lā Al-
         Mawdūdī.
ji 'āla – pledge to make payment.
jurist – faqīh, a specialist in Islamic jurisprudence.
kafāla – guaranty offered on behalf of some party.
Mālikī – belonging to the juristic school of Mālik ibn Anas, see note 24, Chapter
manfa a – usufruct of a property.
maqāssa – mutual debt clearance.
maslaha – public or private benefit, plural maṣāliḥ.
mudāraba - silent partnership.
muft\bar{\imath} – jurist who issues fatw\bar{a}.
murābaḥa – cost-plus sale, often combined with bay bi-thaman ājil.
Al-Ikhwān Al-Muslimūn – Muslim Brotherhood, Islamist group founded by Egyp-
         tian teacher Hassan Al-Banna.
qard – loan of fungible property.
qirād - silent partnership.
qiyās – juristic inference by analogy.
Qur'ān – ultimate Islamic canon, believed to be the revealed word of God.
rahn - collateral or pawned property in lieu of debt.
ribā - major prohibition of Islam, similar but not equivalent to either usury or
         interest, see Chapter 3.
ribawī – property subject to the rules of ribā.
şakk – bond or certificate, plural şukūk.
salam - forward sale with prepaid price.
sanad - bond or certificate, plural sanadāt.
sarf - currency exchange contract.
```



Glossary and Transliteration

xvii

Shāfí ī – belonging to the juristic school of Muḥammad ibn Idrīs Al-Shāfí ī, see note 24, Chapter 2.

Sharī a - revealed divine law in Qur'ān and Sunna.

sharika – partnership, see Chapter 7 for various types.

sukūk – bonds or certificates, plural of sakk.

Sunna – Prophetic or other early Islamic tradition.

tabarru - voluntary contribution.

takāful – mutual guaranty or insurance, used differently in Islamic finance, see Chapter 8.

takhrīj fiqhī – juristic recharacterization of a contract or transaction (usually forbidden) in terms of another (usually permissible).

tawarruq – three-party variation on bay al-ina.

tawliya – sale at cost.

'*urbūn* – down payment on purchase, from which call options are routinely synthesized.

'urf - customary practice, appeals to which may overrule juristic analogy.

wadī'a – fiduciary deposit.

wadī a – sale below cost.

wakāla – agency.

waqf - trust or mortmain, plural awqāf.

zakāh – obligatory Islamic wealth tax.